STRATFORD-ON-AVON DISTRICT COUNCIL

Financial contributions for affordable housing from residential development in Stratford-on-Avon District

Three Dragons & epd July 2017



Document details

Project Ref:	17/0029
--------------	---------

Report Title: Financial contributions for affordable housing from residential development in Stratford-on-Avon District

Doc Ref: Draft report

Date: July 2017

Prepared by: Laura Easton and Mark Felgate

Reviewed by: Lin Cousins

Revision: R03

This report is not a formal land valuation or scheme appraisal. It has been prepared using the HCA Development Appraisal Toolkit and is based on district level data supplied by Stratford-on-Avon District Council, consultation and quoted published data sources. The toolkit provides a review of the development economics of illustrative schemes and the results depend on the data inputs provided. This analysis should not be used for individual scheme appraisal.

No responsibility whatsoever is accepted to any third party who may seek to rely on the content of the report unless previously agreed.

Contents

1	Introdu	uction	. 1
	1.2	Context	. 1
	1.3	National planning context	. 1
	1.4	Local policy context	. 2
2	Approa	ach	. 3
3	Assum	iptions	. 5
4	Viabilit	ty testing	. 6
	4.1	Typologies and mix	. 6
	4.2	Value areas and developer contributions	. 6
	4.3	Results	. 7
5	Option	for a sliding scale	13
6	Conclu	usions and recommendations	15

Tables

Table 4.1 Housing mix and tenure for each typology
Table 4.2a Commuted sums per unit by typology - Stratford-upon-Avon Town (CIL on scenario) 10
Table 4.2b Commuted sums per unit by typology - Stratford-upon-on Avon Town (CIL off scenario). 10
Table 4.2c Commuted sums per unit by typology - Rest of District (CIL on scenario)11
Table 4.2d Commuted sums per unit by typology - Rest of District (CIL off scenario) 11
Table 4.3a Commuted sum (6-10 units) using a standard £ per sq m figure – Stratford-upon- Avon
Town
Table 4.3b Commuted sum (6-10 units) using a standard £ per sq m figure - Rest of District 12
Table 5.1 Approach to a sliding scale of contributions - Stratford-upon-Avon Town (CIL on scenario)

Appendices

Appendix A Assumptions

Appendix B Results

1 Introduction

- 1.1.1 The Council has commissioned Three Dragons and epd to advise on an appropriate methodology for calculating the financial contributions from small sites (6-10 dwellings) and where offsite provision through commuted sums is acceptable on sites of 11 or more dwellings in lieu of the provision of on-site affordable housing.
- 1.1.2 Stratford-on-Avon already has an established affordable housing policy in its Core Strategy which offers the potential for commuted sums. This includes small sites where a financial contribution can be provided in lieu of on-site provision on residential schemes of fewer than 11 dwellings. For sites of 11 to 20 dwellings, where on site provision is rounded down, commuted sums can form part of the balance. However, there is no structured methodology for calculating such contributions.
- 1.1.3 The report sets out:
 - An approach to affordable housing contributions;
 - Assumptions used in testing;
 - Viability testing results;
 - Options for using a sliding scale of contributions;
 - Recommendations.

1.2 Context

1.2.1 Stratford-on-Avon District is largely rural in character and outside the main town of Stratford-upon-Avon the population is widely dispersed, with many small villages and hamlets. The residential property market is still buoyant, especially within Stratford-upon-Avon and its hinterland having the strongest markets.

1.3 National planning context

1.3.1 The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) is clear about the importance of taking viability into account in developing policies for affordable housing (amongst other calls on development):

'Pursuing sustainable development requires careful attention to viability and costs in planmaking and decision-taking. Plans should be deliverable. Therefore, the sites and the scale of development identified in the plan should not be subject to such a scale of obligations and policy burdens that their ability to be developed viably is threatened. To ensure viability, the costs of any requirements likely to be applied to development, such as requirements for affordable housing, standards, infrastructure contributions or other requirements should, when taking account of the normal cost of development and mitigation, provide competitive returns to a willing land owner and willing developer to enable the development to be deliverable'¹

¹ Para 173 NPPF

- 1.3.2 Likewise, the Planning Practice Guidance (PPG) advises that 'Planning obligations must be fully justified and evidenced. Where affordable housing contributions are being sought, planning obligations should not prevent development from going forward'²
- 1.3.3 Further guidance has been published to assist practitioners in undertaking viability studies for policy making purposes "Viability Testing Local Plans Advice for planning practitioners"³. The Advice comments on how viability testing should deal with potential future changes in market conditions and other costs and values and states that:

'The most straightforward way to assess plan policies for the first five years is to work on the basis of current costs and values' (page 26)

1.3.4 In terms of seeking contributions towards affordable housing on small sites the PPG has been updated following the order of the Court of Appeal dated 13 May 2016, which found lawful the policy set out in the Written Ministerial Statement of 28 November 2014. This sets a national approach whereby affordable housing or tariff-style contributions should not be sought from developments of 10-units or less (and have a maximum combined gross floorspace of no more than 1000sqm) but does allow local planning authorities to seek affordable housing contributions from developments of between 6 and 10 units in the form of cash payments in designated rural areas, such as those within Stratford-on-Avon.

1.4 Local policy context

- 1.4.1 The Council's overarching Local Plan the 'Core Strategy' was adopted in July 2016. The key policy is CS.18 Affordable Housing. The policy includes 3 thresholds for the provision of affordable housing. In a number of named parishes (those that include the larger settlements within the district) affordable housing is required for schemes of 11 or more dwellings or 6 or more dwellings where the floorspace exceeds 1,000 sqm. In all other areas (the rural part of the district) the threshold is 6 or more dwellings. The expected level of affordable housing on these qualifying sites is 35%.
- 1.4.2 On sites with fewer than 11 dwellings a contribution to off-site affordable housing is acceptable. On sites of 11 20 homes, where a fraction of an affordable housing unit is required, the fractional requirement will be provided as an off-site contribution. Partial of full offsite provision on sites of 11 or more will only be permitted where exceptional circumstances have been demonstrated to the Council's satisfaction.

² Paragraph: 004 Reference ID: 23b-004-20150326

³ Local Housing Delivery Group, Viability Testing Local Plans, Advice for Planning Practitioners, June 2012. The Local Housing Delivery Group was a cross-industry group, supported by the Local Government Association and the Home Builders Federation

2 Approach

- 2.1.1 National planning policy and guidance does not recommend a standard approach for the viability assessment of commuted sums. In the brief for this work the Council have suggested that the starting point for calculating commuted sums should be an "equivalent value" approach, which means that the cost to a developer making a financial contribution should be the same as if they were providing affordable homes on site.
- 2.1.2 As there is no prescribed method it was considered appropriate to review the approach taken towards commuted sums and financial contributions by other local authorities, especially but not exclusively, by authorities of a rural nature likely to require commuted sums on smaller development sites.
- 2.1.3 The research found that there were 5 main approaches to dealing with the calculation of commuted sums and these are summarised below:
 - Cost based

- either as a straightforward correlation between the cost of developing the affordable units and the commuted sum payable, or

- as development costs (including land) minus the projected Registered Provider contribution⁴

- Development area based expressed as the affordable percentage of each market unit multiplied by the build cost
- Residual value based which is the residual value of a scheme with 100% market housing minus the residual value of scheme including affordable housing = commuted sum
- Gross Development Value (GDV) based which operates either by ascertaining the Open Market Value of the equivalent affordable scheme minus value of affordable scheme as paid by the RP = commuted sum, or calculating the GDV of whole scheme and multiplying by the percentage of affordable dwellings minus RP price paid = commuted sum
- Developer profit based -developer profit over a certain level will be the value of commuted sum, up to a ceiling of a percentage of GDV
- 2.1.4 Having reviewed the respective merits of each of the above options, we consider that a residual value approach is the only method that takes account of the full additional value that market sale units bring to a scheme when affordable housing is provided as a commuted sum, thus meeting the Council's requirement for an equivalent value approach as set out in bullet three, paragraph 50 of the NPPF, which states:

'where they have identified that affordable housing is needed, set policies for meeting this need on site, unless off-site provision or a financial contribution of broadly equivalent value can be robustly justified'

⁴ This is the approach currently sought by the Council

2.1.5 Residual Value is the value of all the costs of development (in this case including the land purchase) as deducted from the gross value of development. The approach is illustrated in Figure 2.1 This methodology is well-established as a means of assessing viability, and in terms of calculating off-site commuted sums, has the added benefit of being entirely independent of the cost of off-site provision, thereby rendering the application of the 'parity' principle unnecessary. It also benefits from ease of application.

Figure 2.1 Residual value approach⁵

Total Development Value (market & affordable)			
Minus			
Total development costs (e.g. including land purchase, developer profit, build cost etc)			
Equals			
Gross Residual Value			
Minus			
CIL and/or S106			
Equals			
Net residual value i.e. surplus or deficit available after all deductions are made for costs			

2.1.6 For the purposes of this work two residual value calculations are undertaken for each development typology. The first is with 100% market housing, while the second test assumes 35% affordable housing on site and 65% market housing. The difference between the two residual values is the equivalent value for a commuted sum. This is shown in Figure 2.2.

Figure 2.2 Commuted sum calculation

Test 1 - RV 100% MV: Residual land value with 100% market housing

Minus

Test 2 - RV AH: Residual land value policy compliant affordable housing (35%)

Equals

Commuted sum

⁵ Diagram does not show an exhaustive list of costs – see also Appendix A.1.4

3 Assumptions

- 3.1.1 The Council's brief is clear that the purpose of the commission is to recommend an appropriate methodology to form the basis of guidance within its forthcoming Development Requirements SPD based on existing policy and its supporting evidence. The commission does not require specific testing of the viability of the schemes on a case by case basis.
- 3.1.2 The research which underpins this viability assessment includes:
 - An analysis of the PBA Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) viability study published in September 2015 and update reports issued during Examination stage 2016/17⁶
 - A refresh of assumptions used in this study using publicly available data, in particular BCIS data to update build costs
 - Discussions with Council officers from the planning and housing departments
 - A series of telephone interviews with the main developing Registered Providers operating in the area, including an assessment of appropriate values (derived from rents and transfer values) to attribute to affordable housing
 - Use of the Homes & Communities Agency Development Appraisal Toolkit⁷ (DAT) to analyse scheme viability for residential development on small sites
- 3.1.3 The assumptions are generally based on those used within the 2015 CIL viability study and updated in respect of values, build costs and the calculation of net rents for affordable housing. A full set of the assumptions used can be found at Appendix A.

⁶ <u>https://www.stratford.gov.uk/planning/community-infrastructure-levy-examination.cfm</u>

⁷ Use of this publicly available toolkit allows for transparency and provides an accessible tool for the council to update in the future https://www.gov.uk/government/collections/development-appraisal-tool

4 Viability testing

4.1 Typologies and mix

- 4.1.1 Site typologies of 6 10 dwellings were tested as these correspond with thresholds for commuted sums on sites of fewer than 11 dwellings as per the PPG. A site size of 15 and 20 dwellings was added to provide the Council with a basis for seeking commuted sums provision in circumstances where a fraction or partial unit applies or where exceptional circumstances allow for more off-site provision. Finally, two larger typologies of 30 and 75 units were included to illustrate the level of a commuted sum that could be sought if the Council was prepared, in an exceptional circumstance, to forego on-site provision.
- 4.1.2 In order to undertake the testing, it was agreed that a static, i.e. set, mix of both affordable and market units should be used for each of the typologies. Each site size was considered and advice sought from the Council as to the appropriate mix and tenure that they would typically seek, taking into account the Core Strategy, historic permissions, housing need and the approach taken in the 2015 CIL study. The mix does move away slightly from the initial 'default' mix identified in the Core Strategy, in particular in relation to 1 bed properties and flatted development following further discussions with Registered Providers. The table below shows the proposed mix and tenure used for each of the typologies. Full details of the mix (including floorspace) can be found in Appendix A and B.
- 4.1.3 The mix is compliant with the 35% affordable housing requirement as at Core Strategy Policy CS.18 and, for the purposes of this study, adopts the 'default' tenure profile for affordable housing (above the threshold) to be split at 60% social rented, 20% affordable rented and 20% affordable intermediate tenure. This profile may, however, be subject to variation in accordance with the Development Requirements SPD.

Number Units	Market units (65%)	Affordable units (35%)	Affordable rented (20%)	Affordable Shared Ownership (20%)	Social rent (60%)
6	3.9	2.1	0.42	0.42	1.26
7	4.55	2.45	0.49	0.49	1.47
8	5.2	2.8	0.56	0.56	1.68
9	5.85	3.15	0.63	0.63	1.89
10	6.5	3.5	0.7	0.7	2.1
15	9.75	5.25	1.05	1.05	3.15
20	13	7	1.4	1.4	2.2
30	19.5	10.5	2.1	2.1	6.3
75	48.75	26.25	5.25	5.25	15.75

4.2 Value areas and developer contributions

4.2.1 The 2015 CIL work identified three broad value areas, however in the interest of simplicity and future updates, the values have been reviewed and it is proposed to use two value areas

- Stratford-upon-Avon Town and the rest of the Stratford-on-Avon District area. In respect of Stratford-upon-Avon Town, the civil/parish boundary is used (as opposed to the Built-up Area Boundary) as this is also the area identified within Core Strategy Policy CS.18. The values were generated using the raw data that supported the CIL Examination. House price data from 2014-2016 is used, and it is noted that values have been relatively static in this area since that period and therefore this data is considered sufficiently up to date for the purposes of this work. Each of the typologies are tested in each area, bringing the testing to 18 cases.

4.2.2 As well as different value areas it is also necessary to test 'CIL on' with more limited S106 and 'CIL off' with a greater level of S106 based contributions. At the time of writing, the Council is awaiting the CIL Examiners' Final Report. For the purpose of testing, therefore, the proposed District-wide residential rates set out in the Council's Submission Charging Schedule are used: £75 per sq m for residential schemes of 10 or fewer dwellings and £150 per sq m for larger schemes.

4.3 Results

- 4.3.1 Figures 4.1a-d show the total potential value of commuted sum for each site typology without indexation (which will need to be applied separately). In each case the green bar (right column) shows the difference between the residual value for a scheme which contains 100% market dwellings (left column)with one that contains 65% market and 35% affordable dwellings (middle column). This difference represents the "equivalence" value and would therefore be considered as the total amount for the commuted sum.
- 4.3.2 The residual value in each case has already accounted for the cost of purchasing the land, as this was a known value; therefore the difference between the 2 residual values is available in entirety for a commuted sum contribution.



Figure 4.1a Comparison of residual values per scheme showing potential commuted sum – Stratford-upon-Avon Town (CIL on scenario)

Figure 4.1b Comparison of residual values per scheme showing potential commuted sum – Stratford-upon-Avon Town (CIL off scenario)





Figure 4.1c Comparison of residual values per scheme showing potential commuted sum – Rest of District (CIL on scenario)

Figure 4.1d Comparison of residual values per scheme showing potential commuted sum – Rest of District (CIL off scenario)



4.3.2 The potential commuted sum can be expressed as an amount per affordable unit foregone. Tables 4.2a-4.2d demonstrate that the potential commuted sum is very similar whatever the scheme size without CIL in place. However, with the 'CIL on' scenarios, the available commuted sum varies between schemes of 10 and fewer and of 11 and more dwellings. This is because of the differential CIL rates applied to these scheme sizes. In practice, off-site contributions will only very rarely be taken from larger sites.

Table 4.2a Commuted sums per unit by typology – Stratford-upon-Avon Town (C	IL on
scenario)	

Total number	35% affordable	Affordable Housing –	Potential commuted sum	commuted sum per affordable	Commuted sum per
units	units housing sq m per schem		per scheme	unit	sqm
6	2.1	181	£231,581	£110,277	£1,279
7	2.45	211	£270,096	£110,243	£1,280
8	2.8	241	£308,775	£110,277	£1,281
9	3.15	271	£347,288	£110,250	£1,282
10	3.5	302	£385,968	£110,277	£1,278
15	5.25	452	£541,046	£103,056	£1,197
20	7	603	£721,484	£103,069	£1,196
30	10.5	904	£1,082,225	£103,069	£1,197
75	26.25	2260	£2,705,496	£103,067	£1,197

Table 4.2b Commuted sums per unit by typology – Stratford-upon-on Avon Town (<u>CIL off</u> scenario)

Total number	35% affordable	Affordable Housing -	Potential commuted sum	Potential commuted sum	Commuted sum per
units	housing	sq m	per scheme	per affordable	sqm
	units			unit	
6	2.1	181	£247,200	£117,714	£1,366
7	2.45	211	£288,311	£117,678	£1,366
8	2.8	241	£329,600	£117,714	£1,368
9	3.15	271	£370,677	£117,675	£1,368
10	3.5	302	£412,000	£117,714	£1,364
15	5.25	452	£618,988	£117,902	£1,369
20	7	603	£825,523	£117,932	£1,369
30	10.5	904	£1,238,184	£117,922	£1,370
75	26.25	2260	£3,095,384	£117,919	£1,370

Total number units	35% affordable housing	Affordable Housing – sq m	Potential commuted sum per	Potential commuted sum per affordable unit	Commuted sum per sqm
	units		scneme		
6	2.1	181	£180,452	£85,930	£997
7	2.45	211	£210,476	£85,909	£998
8	2.8	241	£240,602	£85,929	£998
9	3.15	271	£270,625	£85,913	£999
10	3.5	302	£300,752	£85,929	£996
15	5.25	452	£413,830	£78,825	£916
20	7	603	£551,051	£78,722	£914
30	10.5	904	£826,577	£78,722	£914
75	26.25	2260	£2,066,406	£78,720	£914

Table 4.2c Commuted sums per unit by typology – Rest of District (CIL on scenario)

Table 4.2d Commuted sums per u	nit by typology – Res	t of District (<u>CIL off</u> scenario)
--------------------------------	-----------------------	--

Total number	35% affordable	Affordable Housing –	Potential commuted	Potential commuted sum per affordable	Commuted sum per
units	housing	sq m	sum per	unit	sqm
	units		scheme		
6	2.1	181	£196,070	£93,366	£1,083
7	2.45	211	£228,691	£93,343	£1,084
8	2.8	241	£261,427	£93,366	£1,085
9	3.15	271	£294,045	£93,347	£1,085
10	3.5	302	£326,784	£93,366	£1,082
15	5.25	452	£491,909	£93,696	£1,088
20	7	603	£655,179	£93,597	£1,087
30	10.5	904	£982,768	£93,596	£1,087
75	26.25	2260	£2,456,868	£93,594	£1,087

- 4.3.3 As commuted sums often deal with percentages of units, and to account for different sizes of development that may come forward, it may be considered more useful to express the figures on the basis of square metres. The square meterage is calculated on a standard basis using the national space standards, with the square meterage of the affordable housing being a fixed representation of dwellings the Council would require on small to medium sites in the District. Again, distinctions are on sites of 11 plus due to the variance in CIL rates.
- 4.3.4 Whether measured on a per dwelling or per square metre basis, the testing has shown that greater commuted sums can be collected from developments in Stratford-upon-Avon Town than the rest of the District, and that, with CIL in place, greater commuted sums can be collected from smaller schemes (i.e. 10 dwellings or fewer) than those of 11 or more dwellings.
- 4.3.5 If the Council were to take a simple approach and set the commuted sum level that would apply across all site types but vary between value area and whether CIL is in place, then the following table illustrates what the commuted sums could be for sites of 6 -10 dwellings, assuming the same mix and size of developments suggested for the typologies.

Total	Affordable	Commuted	Total commuted	Commuted	Total
number	housing	sum per sq m	sum payable for	sum per sq m	commuted
units	requirement	<u>CIL on</u>	scheme	CIL off	sum payable
	by sq m				for scheme
6	181	£1,200	£217,200	£1,350	£244,350
7	211	£1,200	£253,200	£1,350	£284,850
8	241	£1,200	£289,200	£1,350	£325,350
9	271	£1,200	£325,200	£1,350	£365,850
10	302	£1,200	£362,400	£1,350	£407,700

Table 4.3a Commuted sum (6-10 units) using a standard £ per sq m figure – <u>Stratford-upon-Avon Town</u>

Table 4.3b Commuted sum (6-10 units) using a standard £ per sq m figure – Rest of District

Total	Affordable	Commuted	Total commuted	Commuted	Total
number	housing	sum per sq m	sum payable for	sum per sq m	commuted
units	requirement	<u>CIL on</u>	scheme	<u>CIL off</u>	sum payable
	by sq m				for scheme
6	181	£900	£162,900	£1,080	£195,480
7	211	£900	£189,900	£1,080	£227,880
8	241	£900	£216,900	£1,080	£260,280
9	271	£900	£243,900	£1,080	£292,680
10	302	£900	£271,800	£1,080	£326,160

- 4.3.6 In terms of sites of 11-20 dwellings where policy allows for partial units or fractions to be provided as a commuted sum or more if exceptional circumstances can be demonstrated, the same principle could apply utilising the standard per metre figure illustrated in Tables 4.3a and 4.3b (i.e £1,200 or £1,350 per sqm in Stratford and £900 or £1,080 per sq m elsewhere). For example if the fractional requirement was the equivalent to half a 90sqm house in Stratford with CIL then it would be 45sqm x £1,200 psqm = £54,000.
- 4.3.7 It should be noted that these sums have been calculated on current costs and values as at April 2017 it is recommended that these are updated annually or following any unusual mid-year fluctuations⁸. The commuted sum should also be recalculated following any significant national or local policy changes.
- 4.3.8 To update on an annual basis an indexation mechanism can be used to update the two key assumptions of build cost and value. To update the build cost BCIS indexation can be used, which the authority will already be using for updating their CIL rates. In terms of values the authority could look to a number of sources including Land Registry and some of the lending agencies that publish regular reports of house price changes.

⁸ I.e. notable fluctuations such as house price crash of 2007/08

5 Option for a sliding scale

- 5.1.1 The application of any policy threshold sometimes leads to what is colloquially known as a "cliff edge" where a site immediately below the threshold has a 0% requirement whereas a site immediately above the threshold has a 100% requirement (in this case 5 and 6 units, respectively). Sometimes this can have a significant impact on development viability or affect the size of schemes coming forward with developers seeking to circumvent the policy requirements by bringing forward sites for fewer units as the smaller site generates a greater development value than the larger site.
- 5.1.2 To overcome this potential issue, the level of commuted sum could be moderated according to the scale of development. This would be used to apply to sites of 6-10 dwellings, where a site of 6 dwellings would be expected to pay less per unit than a development of 10 dwellings, although it is noted that such an approach would not be on a consistent equivalent value basis. This approach has been applied elsewhere such as in the London Borough of Richmond on Thames⁹.
- 5.1.3 This could be achieved in a variety of ways but to keep it simple for both the Council and prospective developers, it is considered that a percentage approach would be the easiest to manage. For simplicity, we have only provided the sliding scale option for one of the scenarios (Stratford-upon-Avon, 'CIL on') as an illustration of how it could work. In table 5.1 we have shown how such an incremental scale could work on sliding scales of 10%, 15% & 20%. (The Council could choose alternative incremental reductions.)

Total	Affordable	Commuted	Ontion 1	Ontion 2	Ontion 2
Total	Affordable	Commuted	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
number	Housing Area	Sum – 100%	Commuted	Commuted	Commuted
units	Required	(see table	Sum – 100%	Sum – 100%	Sum – 100%
		4.4)	for 10 units,	for 10 units,	for 10 units,
			then	then	then
			decreasing by	decreasing by	decreasing by
			10% per	15% per	20% per
			scheme	scheme	scheme
6	2.1 units (181	£217 200	£130,320	£86,880	£43,440
	sqm)	1217,200	(60%)	(40%)	(20%)
7	2.45 units	C2E2 200	£177,240	£139,260	£101,280
	(211 sqm)	1253,200	(70%)	(55%)	(40%)
8	2.8 units (241	C280.200	£231,360	£202,440	£173,520
	sqm)	1289,200	(80%)	(70%)	(60%)
9	3.15 units	C225 200	£292,680	£276,420	£260,160
	(271 sqm)	1323,200	(90%)	(85%)	(80%)
10	3.5 units (302 sqm)	£362,400	£362,400	£362,400	£362,400

Table 5.1 Approach to a sliding scale of contributions – Stratford-upon-Avon Town (CIL on scenario)

⁹ Affordable Housing SPD 2014 LB Richmond on Thames <u>http://www.richmond.gov.uk/affordable_housing_spd</u>

- 5.1.4 In each case the commuted sum is levied at the full rate for 10 units. The percentage payable decreases by a percentage each time so that 10 units makes 100% contribution but 6 units makes a 60%, 40% or 20% contribution (depending whether the scale decreases 10%, 15% or 20% respectively).
- 5.1.5 It is for the Council to decide whether to apply a sliding scale to commuted sums in this way. If a sliding scale is adopted, the Council will need to decide on the level of decrease that it uses. However at the scale we have demonstrated it is unlikely that it will be financially advantageous for a developer to reduce the number of units to avoid affordable housing contributions and we would not recommend a level higher than 20% under current market conditions. The approach shown in Table 5.1 is for illustrative purposes only.

6 Conclusions and recommendations

- 6.1.1 Whilst there are a number of different approaches that can be taken in respect of calculating a commuted sum in lieu of on-site provision of affordable housing, we consider that an 'equivalence approach' is the most robust way to set a commuted sum. This approach compares the residual value of a scheme with 100% market housing with that of a scheme with affordable housing provided on site.
- 6.1.2 For clarity and simplicity for both developers and the Council it is recommended that until CIL is adopted two base rates of commuted sum for each value area are applied, based on the amount of affordable housing that the Council would expect from a scheme of whatever size is proposed. The expected schemes are illustrated in this report and represent the Council's position at this time, with regard to need and past patterns of mix.

	Stratford-upon-Avon Town		Rest of District	
	Per sqm	Per unit	Per sqm	Per unit
CIL off	£1,350	£117,000	£1,080	£93,000
CIL on	£1,200	£103,000	£900	£78,500

- 6.1.3 The council may wish to adopt commuted sum payments on a per square metre or a per unit basis. There is some simplicity achieved by adopting a per unit approach for regular sites of 6-10 units. However where a sum is payable for a proportion of a unit or the market mix is skewed towards larger units it may be easier to operate on a per square metre basis.
- 6.1.4 If CIL is in place then the commuted sum will need to be reduced, reflecting the impact of CIL on development costs.
- 6.1.5 If the Council wishes to introduce a sliding scale, then it is recommended that a simple percentage reduction is used. The level of increment to use is entirely up to the Council, the report provides an illustration using a decreasing increment of 10%, 15% & 20%, however the Council may want to use an alternative reduction.
- 6.1.6 As costs and values vary over time and government policy changes it is recommended that the commuted sum is reviewed on a yearly basis (sooner if there is a fundamental change in government policy). The review should update build costs using BCIS and sales values using the Land Registry Index or similar. These can be inputted by the Council into the (HCA) model provided as part of this commission.

Appendix A Assumptions

- A.1.1 Values (please see section A.1.5 for further details)
- House prices = £3,309 per sqm Stratford-upon-Avon Town (Flats £2,222) = £2,920 per sqm Rest of Stratford-on-Avon District (Flats £2,222)

Location	2 bed house	3 bed house	4 bed house	5 bed house
Stratford	£261,411	£301,119	£413,325	£463,260
Rest of district	£230,680	£265,720	£365,000	£408,800

Land value = £1.3m per net hectare Stratford-upon-Avon Town (CIL study average) = £1m per net hectare Rest of Stratford-on-Avon District (CIL study average)

A.1.2 Dwelling Mix and Size - Dwelling mix and unit sizes provided by Council and based upon CIL study 2015 (density at 30dph for fewer than 11 dwellings and 35dph for 11 plus, consistent with CIL work)

Open Market Housing					
No. People	4p	4/5p	5p	6/7p	8p
Dwelling type	2 bed	3 bed	3bed	4 bed	5 bed
	terrace	terrace	semi	detached	detached
Mix	30%	10%	25%	25%	10%
Sqm per unit	79	91	91	125	139

	Affordable Housing – 35% of units, split as 60% social rented / 20% shared ownership / 20% affordable rent						
No. People	2р	2p 2p 4p 5p 6p					
Dwelling type	1 bed flat -	1bed terrace –					
	on schemes	on schemes	2 bed	3 bed	4 bed		
	over 10 units	10 & under	terrace	terrace/semi	terrace/semi		
Mix		5%	45%	40%	10%		
Sqm per unit	55*	58	79	93	106		

*includes 10% circulation space

A.1.3 Affordable Housing input - Based on consultation undertaken with Registered Providers

Management &	
maintenance	£900
Voids/bad debts	2%
Repairs reserve	£500
Capitalisation	5%
Share size	40%
Rental share	2.75%
Service charges - flats	£7
Service charges -	
houses	£5

Affordable Rents based on 100% LHA rate – using South				
Warwickshire Broad Rental M	arket Area (BRMA) with service			
charge deducted at above rate	es			
Social rents based on 70% of Affordable Rent				
Property Size	Gross rent			
1 bed	£119			
2 bed £150				
3 bed £181				
4 bed	£246			

A.1.4 Other costs

Cost Type	Cost	Notes
Build costs	£1,121 p sqm houses	Median build costs, 5 year
	£1,297 p sqm flats	average, rebased for
	10% Externals	Stratford at 21 st April 2017
	5% contingency	
Finance	6% debit	7% was used in the CIL study
	1% credit	but this could be considered
		conservative as borrowing
		rates have generally
		lowered, therefore 6%
		adopted
Marketing	3% of GDV	As per CIL study
Professional Fees	10% of costs	12% was used in CIL study
		but as this work deals with
		small sites, 10% is
		considered more
		appropriate
Return	20% GDV – Market	As per CIL study
	6% costs - affordable	
CIL	£75 sqm – 10 units or fewer	Assumes CIL rate will be
	£150 sqm – 11 units and over	accepted as drafted.
S106	£1,500 per unit	Based on info supplied by LA
		- to use in the 'without CIL'
		scenario
Abnormals/other opening up	£5,000 per unit	As per CIL study for
costs		greenfield or
		greenfield/brownfield sites
Agents / Legal	1.75%	On land purchase
Stamp Duty Land Tax	Current rates from HMRC	Details available at
		https://www.gov.uk/stamp-
		duty-land-tax/overview

A.1.5 Further details on values

A.1.6 The starting point for values to be used within the commuted sums calculated is the work that underpinned the Council's CIL Charging Scheduled, which was Examined in the autumn/winter of 2016/17. This looked at values at the large strategic site and a three value zone for the rest of the district, with a central, west and east zone. During the course of the

examination there were discussions as to whether all the central area should be within the higher value zone and other points around boundaries of the zones.

- A.1.7 Therefore to keep the process simple and easily updated it is considered that the appropriate figures on which to base values for the purposes of this assessment is a two value area approach of Stratford-upon-Avon Town and the rest of the District. If the data used to inform the CIL examination is reconfigured it can be seen that there is a clear distinction between these two areas, so it is considered an appropriate approach that is evidence based.
- A.1.8 The data used to inform these value areas is taken from Land Registry new build data 2014-2016 to ascertain price, cross referenced with the EPC data for the property size to provide a per square metre value.

Area	Average £ per sqm		
	All	Houses	Flats
All of Stratford-on-			
Avon District	£2,954	£2,976	£2,222
Stratford-upon-Avon			
town	£3,309	£3,309	n/a
Rest of Stratford-on-			
Avon District	£2,897	£2,920	£2,222

Туре	Value £ psqm	Address	Postcode
Detached	£2,967	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,155	SQUIRRELS STREET	CV37 0UL
Detached	£3,230	SQUIRRELS STREET	CV37 0UL
Detached	£3,933	HARES LEAP	CV37 0UQ
Detached	£3,199	SQUIRRELS STREET	CV37 0UL
Detached	£3,059	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,419	THE AVENUE	CV37 ORH
Detached	£3,528	THE AVENUE	CV37 ORH
Detached	£3,098	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,106	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN
Detached	£2,891	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN
Detached	£2,852	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN
Detached	£3,500	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,268	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,591	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ

A.1.9 New Build Land Registry Transactions – Stratford-upon-Avon Town (2014-2016)

Detached	£2,852	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,325	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,106	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,708	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN
Detached	£3,168	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,106	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Detached	£3,983	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH
Detached	£3,819	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH
Detached	£3,792	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH
Semi	£3,722	SQUIRRELS STREET	CV37 0UL
Semi	£2,695	DEERS LEAP	CV37 0UP
Semi	£2,734	DEERS LEAP	CV37 0UP
Semi	£2,734	DEERS LEAP	CV37 0UP
Semi	£3,182	HARES LEAP	CV37 0UQ
Semi	£2,758	DEERS LEAP	CV37 0UP
Semi	£2,734	DEERS LEAP	CV37 0UP
Semi	£3,654	SQUIRRELS STREET	CV37 0UL
Semi	£2,895	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN
Semi	£2,236	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN
Semi	£3,708	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Semi	£3,652	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Semi	£3,564	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Semi	£3,461	BADGERS WAY	CV37 0UJ
Terraced	£3,654	HARES LEAP	CV37 0UQ
Terraced	£2,895	HARES LEAP	CV37 0UQ
Terraced	£3,544	HARES LEAP	CV37 0UQ
Terraced	£3,000	HARES LEAP	CV37 0UQ
Terraced	£3,000	HARES LEAP	CV37 0UQ
Terraced	£3,182	SQUIRRELS STREET	CV37 0UL
Terraced	£3,590	SQUIRRELS STREET	CV37 0UL
Terraced	£3,526	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN
Terraced	£3,397	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN

Terraced	£3,397	OTTERS HOLT	CV37 0UN
Terraced	£6,029	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH
Terraced	£4,338	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH
Terraced	£3,081	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH
Terraced	£4,315	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH
Terraced	£4,178	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH
Terraced	£3,827	CAMPBELL CLOSE	CV37 9EH

A.1.10New Build Land Registry Transactions – Stratford-on-Avon Rest of District (2014-2016)

Туре	Value £ psqm	Address	Postcode
Detached	£2,286		CV37 8AR
Detached	£2,724	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WH
Detached	£2,736	RAVELIN CLOSE	CV37 8WN
Detached	£2,584	RAVELIN CLOSE	CV37 8WN
Detached	£2,696	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Detached	£2,917	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Detached	£2,689	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Detached	£2,802	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Detached	£2,423	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Detached	£2,801	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Detached	£2,696	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Detached	£2,712	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Detached	£2,686	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,854	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,686	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,764	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,683	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,789	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,755	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,805	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,721	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ

Detached	£2,832	UBIQUE AVENUE	CV37 8WQ
Detached	£2,774	RIDEAU ROAD	CV37 8WR
Detached	£2,731	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,686	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,696	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,888	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,755	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,861	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,583	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,832	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,696	ROCHESTER CLOSE	CV37 8WS
Detached	£2,870	MADRAS ROAD	CV37 8WT
Detached	£2,721	MADRAS ROAD	CV37 8WT
Detached	£2,796	MADRAS ROAD	CV37 8WT
Detached	£2,908	MADRAS ROAD	CV37 8WT
Detached	£2,785	MADRAS ROAD	CV37 8WT
Detached	£2,908	SAPPER CLOSE	CV37 8WU
Detached	£2,962	SAPPER CLOSE	CV37 8WU
Detached	£2,653	SAPPER CLOSE	CV37 8WU
Detached	£2,868	SAPPER CLOSE	CV37 8WU
Detached	£2,772	SAPPER CLOSE	CV37 8WU
Detached	£2,861	SAPPER CLOSE	CV37 8WU
Detached	£2,923	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,432	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,432	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,419	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,780	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,727	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,688	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,923	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,699	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW
Detached	£2,813	RICHBOROUGH ROAD	CV37 8WW

Detached	£2,769	GUNDULF ROAD	CV37 8WX
Detached	£12,153	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,906	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£4,306	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,585	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,475	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,599	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,927	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,866	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,673	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,810	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,849	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£3,385	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£4,444	SAMANTHA CLOSE	CV37 8DT
Detached	£2,480	NELSON WAY	B50 4GJ
Detached	£2,480	NELSON WAY	B50 4GJ
Detached	£3,810	BARNCROFT	CV36 5JE
Detached	£3,374	THE SPINNEY	CV35 8DJ
Detached	£3,151	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Detached	£2,825	ROWAN PLACE	B50 4GH
Detached	£2,701	ROWAN PLACE	B50 4GH
Detached	£3,300	THE SPINNEY	CV35 8DJ
Detached	£3,153	THE SPINNEY	CV35 8DJ
Detached	£3,186	THE SPINNEY	CV35 8DJ
Detached	£3,175	THE SPINNEY	CV35 8DJ
Detached	£2,984	ROSE LANE	CV35 9QW
Detached	£3,126	SNOWBERRY LANE	CV35 9SN
Detached	£2,777	NELSON WAY	B50 4GJ
Detached	£3,950	BARNCROFT	CV36 5JE
Detached	£2,579	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,611	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£3,307	THE SPINNEY	CV35 8DJ

Detached	£3,609	WHEELWRIGHT GARDENS	CV36 5LN
Detached	£2,395	LANGSTON WAY	B50 4FZ
Detached	£2,542	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,574	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,692	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,542	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,535	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,632	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,875	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£3,388	GARDINER ROAD	CV35 OBF
Detached	£3,143	GARDINER ROAD	CV35 OBF
Detached	£3,214	GARDINER ROAD	CV35 OBF
Detached	£3,109	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Detached	£3,151	REDHILL WAY	CV35 9QN
Detached	£3,000	ROSE LANE	CV35 9QW
Detached	£3,024	ROSE LANE	CV35 9QW
Detached	£2,869	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Detached	£2,874	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Detached	£2,549	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,500	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,950	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,655	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,605	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,896	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£4,613	REDDITCH ROAD	B95 5NZ
Detached	£3,192	GARDINER ROAD	CV35 OBF
Detached	£2,409	NAPTON ROAD	CV47 8JX
Detached	£2,353	LANGSTON WAY	B50 4FZ
Detached	£2,500	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,570	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,617	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,593	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF

Detached	£2,401	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,523	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£3,084	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Detached	£3,084	MACAULAY LANE	CV35 9QF
Detached	£2,962	MACAULAY LANE	CV35 9QF
Detached	£2,754	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Detached	£2,731	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Detached	£2,500	JUBILEE FIELDS	CV47 8PF
Detached	£1,842	COLLINS CLOSE	CV47 8PJ
Detached	£2,788	COLLINS CLOSE	CV47 8PJ
Detached	£2,673	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,587	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,937	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,638	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,754	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,619	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£3,257	GARDINER ROAD	CV35 OBF
Detached	£3,000	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Detached	£2,857	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Detached	£2,458	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Detached	£2,524	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,800	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Detached	£2,941	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£2,963	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Detached	£2,911	SCHOOL ROAD	CV35 9NH
Detached	£2,882	MACAULAY LANE	CV35 9QF
Detached	£2,815	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Detached	£2,754	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Detached	£2,256	CROMPTON AVENUE	B50 4DG
Detached	£2,587	BIRCH PLACE	B50 4GD
Detached	£2,523	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Detached	£2,419	BRAMLEY WAY	B50 4QG

Detached	£3,025	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£2,773	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Detached	£3,131	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Detached	£1,545	WATERLOO ROAD	B50 4JH
Detached	£2,857	WATERLOO ROAD	B50 4JH
Detached	£2,941	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£2,987	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£3,025	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£2,963	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£2,969	MACAULAY LANE	CV35 9QF
Detached	£2,963	MACAULAY LANE	CV35 9QF
Detached	£3,023	MACAULAY LANE	CV35 9QF
Detached	£2,643	CHAPPLE HYAM AVENUE	CV47 2AF
Detached	£3,046	CHAPPLE HYAM AVENUE	CV47 2AF
Detached	£2,989	CHAPPLE HYAM AVENUE	CV47 2AF
Detached	£3,046	CHAPPLE HYAM AVENUE	CV47 2AF
Detached	£3,095	HARTSHORE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Detached	£2,826	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Detached	£3,012	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Detached	£2,888	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Detached	£2,773	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Detached	£3,083	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Detached	£2,561	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£4,293	ORCHARD CLOSE	CV35 OTP
Detached	£3,037	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£3,025	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£3,025	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Detached	£3,034	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Detached	£3,037	MACAULAY LANE	CV35 9QF
Detached	£3,348	WILKINS WAY	CV36 4PS
Detached	£2,540	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,687	WATERLOO ROAD	B50 4JH

Detached	£3,019	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£2,969	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Detached	£2,583	FARRINGTON CLOSE	CV35 9TL
Detached	£3,278	WILKINS WAY	CV36 4PS
Detached	£2,826	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Detached	£2,574	LANGSTON WAY	B50 4FZ
Detached	£2,649	LANGSTON WAY	B50 4FZ
Detached	£2,759	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Detached	£2,675	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£3,015	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,675	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£3,025	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Detached	£2,667	FARRINGTON CLOSE	CV35 9TL
Detached	£2,730	FARRINGTON CLOSE	CV35 9TL
Detached	£3,780	WILKINS WAY	CV36 4PS
Detached	£3,759	WHEELWRIGHT GARDENS	CV36 5LN
Detached	£3,722	WHEELWRIGHT GARDENS	CV36 5LN
Detached	£2,783	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Detached	£3,488	LONG GROUND	CV35 9AH
Detached	£3,256	LONG GROUND	CV35 9AH
Detached	£2,941	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Detached	£3,492	LONG GROUND	CV35 9AH
Detached	£3,452	LONG GROUND	CV35 9AH
Detached	£3,417	LONG GROUND	CV35 9AH
Detached	£2,689	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Detached	£2,783	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Detached	£2,814	LANGSTON WAY	B50 4FZ
Detached	£2,941	REDHILL WAY	CV35 9QN
Detached	£2,965	REDHILL WAY	CV35 9QN
Detached	£2,941	REDHILL WAY	CV35 9QN
Detached	£2,731	LANGSTON WAY	B50 4FZ
Detached	£2,783	LANGSTON WAY	B50 4FZ

Detached	£2,870	LANGSTON WAY	B50 4FZ
Detached	£2,655	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GA
Detached	£2,506	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,736	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,632	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,885	REDHILL WAY	CV35 9QN
Detached	£2,923	REDHILL WAY	CV35 9QN
Detached	£2,822	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Detached	£2,788	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£2,619	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Detached	£3,000	NURSERIES ROAD	CV35 9QL
Detached	£2,885	REDHILL WAY	CV35 9QN
Flat	£2,045	BAILEY AVENUE	CV37 8QW
Flat	£2,045	BAILEY AVENUE	CV37 8QW
Flat	£1,923	BAILEY AVENUE	CV37 8QW
Flat	£2,317	BAILEY AVENUE	CV37 8QW
Flat	£2,079	BAILEY AVENUE	CV37 8QW
Flat	£1,940	BAILEY AVENUE	CV37 8QW
Flat	£2,074	BAILEY AVENUE	CV37 8QW
Flat	£2,500	WELLINGTON AVENUE	CV37 8WB
Flat	£2,344	WELLINGTON AVENUE	CV37 8WB
Flat	£2,629	WELLINGTON AVENUE	CV37 8WD
Flat	£2,500	WELLINGTON AVENUE	CV37 8WD
Flat	£2,237	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Flat	£2,281	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Flat	£2,297	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Flat	£2,323	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Flat	£2,222	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Flat	£2,187	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Flat	£2,222	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Flat	£2,355	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Flat	£2,177	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG

Semi	£2,543	CARTERS VIEW	CV37 8TG
Semi	£2,571	CARTERS VIEW	CV37 8TG
Semi	£2,901	WELLINGTON AVENUE	CV37 8WD
Semi	£2,839	WELLINGTON AVENUE	CV37 8WD
Semi	£2,740	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Semi	£3,083	RAVELIN CLOSE	CV37 8WN
Semi	£3,083	RAVELIN CLOSE	CV37 8WN
Semi	£2,234	RAVELIN CLOSE	CV37 8WN
Semi	£2,234	RAVELIN CLOSE	CV37 8WN
Semi	£3,033	RAVELIN CLOSE	CV37 8WN
Semi	£3,067	RAVELIN CLOSE	CV37 8WN
Semi	£2,162	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Semi	£2,207	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Semi	£2,716	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Semi	£2,778	WESTERN HEIGHTS ROAD	CV37 8WP
Semi	£2,877	CAMBERLEY WAY	CV37 8WY
Semi	£2,877	CAMBERLEY WAY	CV37 8WY
Semi	£3,354	PIGEON GREEN	CV37 OLP
Semi	£3,261	HEADLAND CLOSE	CV37 8EU
Semi	£2,875	FOXES LANE	CV37 9XQ
Semi	£2,773	FOXES LANE	CV37 9XQ
Semi	£2,750	FOXES LANE	CV37 9XQ
Semi	£2,792	FOXES LANE	CV37 9XQ
Semi	£2,667	FOXES LANE	CV37 9XQ
Semi	£2,812	ROWAN PLACE	B50 4GH
Semi	£2,662	NELSON WAY	B50 4GJ
Semi	£2,953	ROWAN PLACE	B50 4GH
Semi	£2,937	ROWAN PLACE	B50 4GH
Semi	£2,813	ROWAN PLACE	B50 4GH
Semi	£2,812	ROWAN PLACE	B50 4GH
Semi	£2,941	MARLOW GREEN	CV47 2QF
Semi	£3,252	GARDINER ROAD	CV35 0BF

Semi	£3,250	HONEYSUCKLE LANE	CV35 9SG
Semi	£3,250	HONEYSUCKLE LANE	CV35 9SG
Semi	£2,736	COZENS STREET	CV35 9SU
Semi	£3,118	MARLOW GREEN	CV47 2QF
Semi	£2,941	MARLOW GREEN	CV47 2QF
Semi	£3,176	MARLOW GREEN	CV47 2QF
Semi	£2,750	RUSSET WAY	B50 4QN
Semi	£3,167	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Semi	£3,167	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Semi	£2,464	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Semi	£2,500	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Semi	£2,464	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Semi	£2,573	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Semi	£2,991	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GA
Semi	£2,545	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Semi	£2,500	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Semi	£2,518	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Semi	£2,532	JUBILEE FIELDS	CV47 8PF
Semi	£2,455	MACAULAY ROAD	CV47 2BG
Semi	£2,474	JUBILEE FIELDS	CV47 8PF
Semi	£2,700	BRAMLEY WAY	B50 4QG
Semi	£2,688	BRAMLEY WAY	B50 4QG
Semi	£2,968	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Semi	£2,952	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Semi	£2,794	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Semi	£2,956	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Semi	£2,596	KINETON ROAD	CV35 9NE
Semi	£3,139	CHAPPLE HYAM AVENUE	CV47 2AF
Semi	£3,055	CHAPPLE HYAM AVENUE	CV47 2AF
Semi	£3,055	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Semi	£3,125	HARTSHORNE ROAD	CV47 2BF
Semi	£2,941	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE

Semi	£2,430	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Semi	£2,569	KINETON ROAD	CV35 9NE
Semi	£2,868	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Semi	£2,590	KINETON ROAD	CV35 9NE
Semi	£2,661	KINETON ROAD	CV35 9NE
Semi	£2,588	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Semi	£2,823	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Semi	£2,823	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Semi	£3,125	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Semi	£3,125	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Semi	£2,232	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Semi	£2,942	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Semi	£2,552	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Semi	£2,586	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Semi	£2,698	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Semi	£2,794	ELM PLACE	B50 4GE
Semi	£2,898	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Semi	£2,855	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Semi	£2,593	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Semi	£2,232	COPENHAGEN WAY	B50 4FY
Semi	£2,721	CHESTNUT WAY	B50 4GF
Terraced	£2,833	ALBERT CLOSE	CV37 8WE
Terraced	£2,740	ALBERT CLOSE	CV37 8WE
Terraced	£3,033	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Terraced	£2,950	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Terraced	£2,933	CHATHAM ROAD	CV37 8WG
Terraced	£2,740	ABNEY ROAD	CV37 8WJ
Terraced	£3,000	ABNEY ROAD	CV37 8WJ
Terraced	£3,000	ABNEY ROAD	CV37 8WJ
Terraced	£2,740	ABNEY ROAD	CV37 8WJ
Terraced	£3,000	RIDEAU ROAD	CV37 8WR
Terraced	£2,951	RIDEAU ROAD	CV37 8WR

Terraced	£2,951	RIDEAU ROAD	CV37 8WR
Terraced	£2,726	RIDEAU ROAD	CV37 8WR
Terraced	£2,941	ROWAN PLACE	B50 4GH
Terraced	£2,747	TOWER HILL	B50 4DZ
Terraced	£3,059	MARLOW GREEN	CV47 2QF
Terraced	£2,697	TOWER HILL	B50 4DZ
Terraced	£3,927		CV35 0EQ
Terraced	£3,571		CV35 0EQ
Terraced	£4,028		CV35 0EQ
Terraced	£2,961	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Terraced	£2,913	COPELAND AVENUE	CV35 9LZ
Terraced	£2,850	MACAULAY LANE	CV35 9QF
Terraced	£2,913	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Terraced	£2,864	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Terraced	£2,913	GRANTHAM ROAD	CV35 9JJ
Terraced	£2,336	GAYDON FARM BARNS	CV35 0EX

Appendix B Results

B.1.1 Results for commuted sums viability – Stratford-on-Avon District

Market Area	CIL / S106	No. units	no. Affordable	no. Market	Affordable floor area sqm	Market floor area	Market floor area all	net to gross	RV with Affordable units	RV without Affordable units	Difference	per affordable unit	per affordable sqm
						sqm	market site						
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	6	2.1	3.9	181	393	604	100%	£72,983	£304,564	£231,581	£110,277	£1,279
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	7	2.45	4.55	211	459	705	100%	£88,026	£358,122	£270,096	£110,243	£1,280
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	8	2.8	5.2	241	524	806	100%	£89,201	£397,976	£308,775	£110,277	£1,281
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	9	3.15	5.85	271	590	903	100%	£104,271	£451,559	£347,288	£110,250	£1,282
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	10	3.5	6.5	302	655	1007	100%	£119,233	£505,201	£385,968	£110,277	£1,278
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	15	5.25	9.75	452	983	1510	100%	£189,867	£730,913	£541,046	£103,056	£1,197
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	20	7	13	603	1310	2014	80%	£254,199	£975,683	£721,484	£103,069	£1,196
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	30	10.5	19.5	904	1966	3021	80%	£369,125	£1,451,350	£1,082,225	£103,069	£1,197
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	CIL	75	26.25	48.75	2260	4914	7552	80%	£921,061	£3,626,557	£2,705,496	£103,067	£1,197
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	S106	6	2.1	3.9	181	393	604	100%	£93,062	£340,262	£247,200	£117,714	£1,366
Stratford-upon- Avon Town	S106	7	2.45	4.55	211	459	705	100%	£111,459	£399,770	£288,311	£117,678	£1,366

Market Area	CIL /	No.	no.	no.	Affordable	Market	Market	net to	RV with	RV without	Difference	per	per affordable
	S106	units	Affordable	Market	floor area	floor	floor	gross	Affordable	Affordable		affordable	sqm
					sqm	sam	market		units	units		unit	
						3411	site						
Stratford-upon-	S106	8	2.8	5.2	241	524	806	100%	£115,973	£445,573	£329,600	£117,714	£1,368
Avon Town		_											
Stratford-upon-	S106	9	3.15	5.85	271	590	903	100%	£134,430	£505,107	£370,677	£117,675	£1,368
Avon Iown	64.06	10	2.5	6.5	202	655	1007	4.000/	0450.000	0564.600	6442.000		64.964
Stratford-upon-	S106	10	3.5	6.5	302	655	1007	100%	£152,698	£564,698	£412,000	£11/,/14	£1,364
Avon Iown	6106	45	5.25	0.75	452	002	1510	1000/	6242 500	6024 506	6640.000	6117.002	C1 2C0
Stratford-upon-	2106	15	5.25	9.75	452	983	1510	100%	£312,598	£931,586	£618,988	£117,902	£1,369
Avon Town	\$106	20	7	12	602	1210	2014	0.00/	£417 910	£1 242 242	£025 522	£117 022	£1.260
	3100	20	/	12	005	1210	2014	80%	1417,019	L1,243,342	1025,525	1117,952	11,509
Stratford-upon-	S106	30	10.5	19.5	904	1966	3021	80%	£614.554	f1.852.738	f1.238.184	f117.922	£1.370
Avon Town	0100	00	10.0	10.0	501	1000	0021	00/0	2021,001	21,002,700	11,200,101		22,070
Stratford-upon-	S106	75	26.25	48.75	2260	4914	7552	80%	£1,534,651	£4,630,035	£3,095,384	£117,919	£1,370
Avon Town												, i	
Rest of District	CIL	6	2.1	3.9	181	393	604	100%	£12,300	£192,752	£180,452	£85,930	£997
Rest of District	CIL	7	2.45	4.55	211	459	705	100%	£17,340	£227,816	£210,476	£85,909	£998
Rest of District	CIL	8	2.8	5.2	241	524	806	100%	£11,361	£251,963	£240,602	£85,929	£998
Rest of District	CIL	9	3.15	5.85	271	590	903	100%	£15,512	£286,137	£270,625	£85,913	£999
Rest of District	CIL	10	3.5	6.5	302	655	1007	100%	£19,556	£320,308	£300,752	£85,929	£996
Rest of District	CIL	15	5.25	9.75	452	983	1510	100%	£19,001	£432,831	£413,830	£78,825	£916
Rest of District	CIL	20	7	13	603	1310	2014	80%	£26,114	£577,165	£551,051	£78,722	£914
Rest of District	CIL	30	10.5	19.5	904	1966	3021	80%	£28,541	£855,118	£826,577	£78,722	£914
Rest of District	CIL	75	26.25	48.75	2260	4914	7552	80%	£66,550	£2,132,956	£2,066,406	£78,720	£914

Financial contributions for affordable housing

Market Area	CIL /	No.	no.	no.	Affordable	Market	Market	net to	RV with	RV without	Difference	per	per affordable
	S106	units	Affordable	Market	floor area	floor	floor	gross	Affordable	Affordable		affordable	sqm
					sqm	area	area all		units	units		unit	
						sqm	market						
							site						
Rest of District	S106	6	2.1	3.9	181	393	604	100%	£32,380	£228,450	£196,070	£93,366.67	£1,083
Rest of District	S106	7	2.45	4.55	211	459	705	100%	£40,773	£269,464	£228,691	£93,343.27	£1,084
Rest of District	S106	8	2.8	5.2	241	524	806	100%	£38,134	£299,561	£261,427	£93,366.79	£1,085
Rest of District	S106	9	3.15	5.85	271	590	903	100%	£45,639	£339,684	£294,045	£93,347.62	£1,085
Rest of District	S106	10	3.5	6.5	302	655	1007	100%	£53,021	£379,805	£326,784	£93,366.86	£1,082
Rest of District	S106	15	5.25	9.75	452	983	1510	100%	£141,732	£633,641	£491,909	£93,696.95	£1,088
Rest of District	S106	20	7	13	603	1310	2014	80%	£189,733	£844,912	£655,179	£93,597.00	£1,087
Rest of District	S106	30	10.5	19.5	904	1966	3021	80%	£273,971	£1,256,739	£982,768	£93,596.95	£1,087
Rest of District	S106	75	26.25	48.75	2260	4914	7552	80%	£419,746	£2,876,614	£2,456,868	£93,594.97	£1,087

Financial contributions for affordable housing